

Recruiting for Diversity in Law Enforcement: Selected Recent Research Insights

**Jane Wiseman
Institute for Excellence in Government, Inc.**

August 2021

Introduction:

The killing of George Floyd in May of 2020 and the social movements inspired by his killing have shined a spotlight on long-simmering tensions around policing and race in America. While police legitimacy is not routinely measured like unemployment or GDP, many assume that public trust and confidence in law enforcement has declined. The confidence of law enforcement leaders in their ability to attract and retain talent has been measured - and has declined. A 2019 survey showed that 63% of law enforcement agencies had fewer applications than in the past¹ and a 2020 survey of state and local hiring officials showed that by a margin of more than two to one law enforcement had more open positions than qualified applicants².

While data is not yet available for 2021, anecdotal evidence points to a sharp decline in interest in entering the field of law enforcement. Likely this is driven by a confluence of factors - diminished public respect for the profession³, a more complex and dangerous job⁴, greater public scrutiny often with bystander or body-worn camera video, and a post-pandemic desire for different ways of working that include remote work and flexible schedules, neither of which is typically available in the law enforcement field.

The final report of the President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing⁵ included a robust set of recommendations on improving hiring for diversity - but that document is now half a decade old. The most exhaustive and insightful national snapshot of police recruitment and training best practice is now over a decade old⁶. And a comprehensive review of scholarly sources on the topic was completed in 2019 but it is not available to practitioners⁷.

With a lack of recent research-based insight, this document seeks to assist law enforcement agencies in hiring a diverse force, in support of the representative

¹ Police Executive Research Forum, *The Workforce Crisis, and What Police Agencies Are Doing About It*, September, 2019.

² Center for State and Local Government Excellence, *State and Local Government Workforce: 2020 Survey*, April 2020.

³ 91% of respondents to a [survey](#) on the National Law Enforcement Applied Research and Data Platform noted that the public now treats them with less respect, from "Five Things You need to Know From Agencies Participating in the National Law Enforcement Applied Data & Research Platform," National Police Foundation, January 2019.

⁴ 97% of respondents to a [survey](#) on the National Law Enforcement Applied Research and Data Platform indicated they now are more worried about their safety than in the past, *ibid*.

⁵ President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing. 2015. *Final Report of the President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing*. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services.

⁶ Wilson, J.M., Dalton, E., Scheer, C., & Grammich, C.A. (2010). "Police recruitment and retention for the new millennium: The state of knowledge." RAND Corporation: Santa Monica, CA.

⁷ Donohue Jr., R.H. "Shades of Blue: A review of the hiring, recruitment, and selection of female and minority police officers." *The Social Science Journal* (2019).

bureaucracy theory that a more diverse force will improve trust and confidence. In short, the recommendations include:

Hiring for Diversity in Law Enforcement Recommendations based on Research

Recommendation 1: Widen outreach strategies to attract more candidates.

Recommendation 2: Make the process more efficient.

Recommendation 3: Support recruits so that fewer abandon the process.

Recommendation 4: Employ targeted recruitment strategies to attract candidates of color.

Recommendation 5: Employ targeted recruitment strategies to attract female candidates.

Recommendation 6: Experiment with recruiting varied messages and then focus on what works.

The pages that follow present insights from recent research that may help law enforcement leaders to attract more women and people of color to their recruitment process, and retain more of them during the selection process. This document includes:

Section 1: Recommendations. A compilation of recommendations from this author based on insights from the research as well as recommendations that come directly from the authors of the studies;

Section 2: Themes from the research. A thematic summary of the insights across research studies covering areas such as attracting candidates, recruitment processes, organizational culture and diversity, and recruitment issues specific to women and to people of color; and

Section 3: Listing of studies. An alphabetical list of studies considered with key findings from each, along with this author's recommended actions to improve law enforcement recruiting outcomes based on the study findings.

Section 1: Recommendations to improve recruitment for diversity in law enforcement, based on research:

The recommendations below are this author's ideas for actions that a law enforcement agency can take based on insights from recent research.

Recommendation 1: Widen outreach strategies to attract more candidates.

For many years, law enforcement has been able to rely on a steady stream of interested candidates, but for some agencies, it is becoming important to widen the net of interested candidates by reaching more audiences. Research-based ways to do this include:

- **Start young – in elementary school.** Children begin to imagine their future careers long before a recruiter talks to them about entering law enforcement – they do this through imaginative play, with the Halloween costumes they choose and the like. Law enforcement agencies should find ways to engage with young people in elementary school to spark the “childhood dream” motivation of becoming an officer, and use this theme in advertising messages (Gibbs, Todak).
- **Continually engage youth in middle school, high school and college.** Developing Explorer, Cadet, and internship programs are ways to allow young people access to learn about the profession, and to keep youth engaged as civilians until they are old enough to apply for a job as a sworn officer (Gibbs).
- **Provide interested applicants with opportunities to preview the job.** A realistic understanding of the day to day work of policing (referred to as a realistic job preview) has been shown to reduce attrition from the job. Low cost ways to do this include [video blogs](#) about the realities of the job, as well as ride-alongs, mentoring, and job shadowing. These engagement efforts take on more importance given that in one survey, respondents had unrealistic expectations about not wanting to work their way up from an entry level position -- 68% agreed that “people of my generation want an immediately successful career without “paying their dues” at an entry level position,” and only 24% agreed that police departments understand their generation (Scheer, Rossler and Papania).
- **Partner with military/veterans organizations and schools of criminal justice.** Given that multiple studies show that students in criminal justice programs and individuals with military experience are well represented among those interested in a law enforcement career, any agency not currently recruiting at military bases or via veterans organizations, or at schools of criminal justice should do so.

Recommendation 2: Make the process more efficient.

Many candidates drop out of the selection process because it takes too long. Agencies may well be missing out on high quality candidates who take other jobs rather than waiting the year or two that it takes from initial interest to selection or entering the academy. Simplifying the process can facilitate retaining greater numbers of interested candidates through the selection process. Close examination of the process can help identify bottlenecks that can be reduced to decrease the friction in the process.

Research-based ways to simplify the process include:

- **Shorten the process.** Shorten the application process by eliminating unnecessary steps or delays, grouping multiple hurdles to be completed at the same time, or by allowing them to proceed along parallel tracks (Linos, Gibbs). Shifting mindset to view each step of the process as a micro-decision by the candidate to continue interest can help provide focus on shortening the process (Linos).
- **Simplify language.** Simplify language in recruiting messages to reduce confusion and save time (Linos).
- **Leverage technology for applications.** Implement paperless processes for application and testing to improve efficiency and transparency (Gibbs; Krueger, Robson & Keller).
- **Use an applicant tracking system to make the process more transparent.** Use a recruit tracking system to monitor progress at all stages of the selection process, including demographic information and information on reasons for choosing to apply. This will allow analysis of the characteristics most likely to lead from expression of interest to application, and to success in the recruitment and selection process, in the academy, and ultimately on the job (Krueger, Robson & Keller). It also improves efficiency and provides greater transparency at all levels.
- **Provide digital tools to speed the process of securely submitting documents.** Electronic compilation of background investigation materials by recruits reduces the time it takes to conduct a background investigation and improves accuracy of information. A self-assessment tool allows recruits to see what will be collected, how it will be assessed, and enables them to address issues that arise. For example, a recruit with a low credit score can begin working on that before his or her official background check process begins, speeding and improving the result (Krueger, Robson & Keller).

Recommendation 3: Support recruits so that fewer abandon the process.

Some candidates become disinterested in applying based on misinformation or based on a process that is overly complex and confusing or that presents logistical, schedule or transportation challenges – in one survey 19% of females and 12% of males were

intimidated by the police recruiting process (Scheer, Rossler and Papania). Ways to reduce unnecessary attrition from the recruiting pipeline include:

- **Make sure requirements are clear.** Some may self-select out the process because they perceive barriers that do not exist, so being clear about entrance requirements can help. For example, in one study, women interested in police jobs were more likely to apply when they knew the fitness requirements, which indicates they may have thought the requirements were more stringent than they were (Aiello).
- **Assign a mentor to each recruit.** Mentoring has long been a part of police culture in the form of field training. This could be extended to the recruitment process. One study showed that 70% of students in criminal justice programs said a mentor would be a help to them in choosing a police career (Scheer, Rossler and Papania). Implementing “buddy” or coach programs can help candidates through the process, as the military does with their “battle buddy” program and as other police agencies have done (Gibbs).
- **Keep recruits informed.** Some recruits may drop out or take other jobs if they assume they are not still active in the process. Automating communications (via email or text) enables more frequent communication with candidates in the process so they know they are still being considered (Gibbs).
- **Use current communications methods, such as chatbots and text messaging.** Use live chat to engage recruits (Krueger, Robson & Keller), and enable broad based text message communications with recruits, as well as one on one text-message communication between recruits and mentors.

Recommendation 4: Employ targeted recruitment strategies to attract candidates of color.

Many law enforcement agencies struggle to attract and retain people of color. Multiple studies have shown that people of color are no less likely to be interested in a career in law enforcement, but perceive more barriers to entry and to their success. One issue shown in a survey of criminal justice students is that family disapproval of a police career choice was highest for African American students – at nearly three times the rate for whites (28% of African American, 16% for Latinx, and 10% for whites, Scheer, Rossler and Papania). Further, many people of color believe that police engage in racial profiling, with 67% of African American, 52% of Latinx, 28% of white, 45% of other students agreeing (Scheer, Rossler and Papania). African American and Hispanic law enforcement officers in one survey noted their peers viewed their actions through a racial lens and that they experienced subtle and unconscious racism in the form of lack of opportunities; peer support and mentoring were found to increase retention of people of color in law enforcement (Suboch, Harrington and House). Research based ways to improve recruitment of people of color include:

- **Prioritize diversity and inclusion.** Appoint a senior leader with responsibility for diversity, given that research shows “One of the strongest factors influencing increases in organizational diversity is establishing positions with responsibility for diversity efforts” (Krueger, Robson & Keller).
- **Look for ways to level the playing field at each hurdle in the selection process.** By looking at success at each step of the process by race and ethnicity, there may be steps that produce disparate outcomes for people of color, which can pinpoint where change is needed. For example, one experiment in the UK closed racial gaps in test pass rates by modifying the language on the email inviting the candidate to take the test and “priming” them for success with an encouraging tone. This experiment changed the authoritarian tone of the email to a more welcoming one and improved test scores for all while closing the gap between whites and candidates of color (Linos, Reinhard and Ruda).
- **Mentor people of color during the recruiting process.** Candidates of color, whose families are more likely to disapprove of the career choice than white recruits, might be especially helped by mentoring. Scholars recommend recasting the recruiter in a “football coach” model: meeting with the family, exercising with the candidate, building rapport, and opening lines of communication (Scheer, Rossler and Papania). In one example, the Guardians Association for Black NYPD officers mentors applicants through the process (Gibbs).
- **Proactively build community ties in communities of color.** Police agencies can attract African-American recruits by “improving perceptions of the police in Black and African-American communities” (Rossler, Scheer and Suttmoeller). The authors suggest outreach to community and faith-based organizations as well as direct one-on-one engagement with the candidate as well as their influencers for example with home visits, or speaking directly to a candidate’s family (ibid).
- **Assess and address organizational culture.** The culture may be turning people of color away, either at the start or once they begin their career. People of color had more concern about “fit” with the agency than did whites (Clikinbeard, Solomon and Rief) and experienced tokenism (Suboch, Harrington and House). To address this, organizations can conduct a survey or engage an outside expert to examine organizational culture for the degree to which it is welcoming and inclusive.
- **Design and test targeted messages to attract and retain more people of color.** Test multiple targeted messages in recruiting materials – some will work and others will fail, so quickly learning the effectiveness allows for a nimble and successful process. Some studies have shown that people of color are motivated to enter law enforcement to help change the profession, so testing a “be the change” message is one option. Every community will have its own unique blend of messaging that will work best, so testing various options and assessing results can be beneficial. For example, LAPD increased the number of minority

applicants with Facebook ads targeting predominantly Black communities (Behavioral Insights Team).

Recommendation 5: Employ targeted recruitment strategies to attract female candidates.

Many law enforcement agencies struggle to hire female officers, a challenge often more difficult for smaller or rural organizations. Females are far less likely to be interested in a law enforcement career than males; perceive more barriers to success, opportunity, and acceptance on the job; and have lower respect for law enforcement. Fears specific to women include the fitness requirements both for selection and for their time at the academy – in one study, 43% of female college student survey respondents were intimidated by the fitness element of the training academy (Scheer, Rossler and Papania). One study, looking across four agencies, found that when women constituted fewer than 20% of their academy class, they had higher attrition from the academy than men did – but when academy classes were 25% female or more, there was no difference between male and female attrition from the academy (Schuck). Research-based methods to improve the recruitment of female officers include:

- **Create specific messaging aimed at attracting female recruits.** For females to be able to literally “see” themselves in the career, they must be present in the organization and in the recruitment materials it uses. One study of over 200 recruitment videos found that while women were present in the vast majority of videos, they spoke on average half of the amount of time that males did, sending a subtle message that they matter less in the organization (Koslicki). One successful example of messaging targeting women is in Washington, DC, where women who received a postcard with a female officer on it with the message that policing was their “next step,” three times as many applied (Behavioral Insights Team).
- **Create a support network and leverage it to mentor recruits.** Create a support network for women in the organization, and consider extending support to female recruits as they go through the selection process (Krueger, Robson & Keller). For example, Minneapolis hosts a Women’s Leadership Academy, a week-long program about policing that includes follow up support through the application process (Gibbs).
- **Assess the academy for ways it can be more female-friendly.** Academy practices that are disconcerting to women should be examined (e.g. being Tasered), and if changed then the changes should be made clear in recruiting efforts (Rossler, Rabe-Hemp, Peuterbaugh and Scheer). One study recommends removing the fitness requirement from the screening process entirely, and instead building it into the academy (Krueger, Robson & Keller). Academy policies, procedures and overall climate should be assessed to assure that they have zero tolerance for discrimination based on gender. A lack of reported

incidents does not mean that they do not happen. In one study of police officers recounting their time in the academy, women did not report the discriminatory behavior they endured during training, often instead relying on peer support to get through it. Women reported in the survey that they had endured sexist remarks, insulting behaviors, sexist attitudes, and explicit material or jokes, but did not report this as discriminatory behavior to authorities at the academy in an attempt to fit in (Suboch, Harrington and House).

- ***Make the job more family-friendly.*** Family-friendly policies, such as access to sponsored childcare, flexible work schedules, maternity leave policies, etc. may lower barriers to women believing they can succeed in the career, and may increase the number of female applicants (Rossler, Rabe-Hemp, Peuterbaugh and Scheer).
- ***Improve career paths for women.*** Making upward mobility possible for female officers via mentoring and eliminating barriers can demonstrate that female applicants' perceived barriers can be broken in the "brass ceiling" (Rossler, Rabe-Hemp, Peuterbaugh and Scheer).

Recommendation 6: Use targeted recruiting messaging to reach specific audiences, leverage digital marketing, and experiment to see what methods and messages work best for each.

One finding from the research is that helping others was the most consistent top reason to enter the profession, but was seldom an effective recruiting message alone, so multiple messages should be used. Choosing which messages to use is facilitated with digital marketing.

Digital marketing is significantly less expensive than traditional media and can be more effective in reaching niche audiences with messages tailored to their unique motivations. As a result, many law enforcement agencies have successfully moved increasing amounts of their recruitment budgets from traditional to digital media. Some agencies use internal resources and many more use digital marketing firms to help tailor messages to specific audiences - with greater specificity and at lower cost than traditional media. For example, a state police agency seeking to recruit more Black troopers used geofencing to send its recruiting ad to every attendee at a graduation ceremony for a Historically Black College in its state. Low cost digital marketing offers the opportunity to target specific populations, or those who are motivated by a specific message and to send ads just to those who will be influenced by that type of message.

As mentioned previously, targeted outreach to women and people of color is necessary to recruit a more diverse force. These same targeting and experimentation strategies should be used across the recruiting function, whether to reach veterans, bilingual candidates, or any other group. Some successful efforts to test and refine marketing strategies in law enforcement include:

- An experiment in South Bend, IN tested sending postcards to potential recruits that referred to officer's identity at home and at work, and found them seven times as effective as not sending a postcard in getting people to apply (Behavioral Insights Team).
- Tacoma, WA had a fourfold increase in applicants after adopting the "You belong here" message in its marketing, using personalized postcards. Postcards had simple, clear instructions and came from new officers or mid-management, not senior leaders so that potential recruits would have an easier time seeing their future selves in the role (Behavioral Insights Team).
- One experiment focused on getting more applicants to adhere to timelines in the selection process and 15% more applicants submitted their background check forms to the LAPD, and 40% more sent them in within 2 weeks when the wording of the email was improved and with a short text message reminder (Behavioral Insights Team).
- Another experiment in San Jose asked recruits who had dropped out of the process to provide feedback and consider reapplying, and 125 reactivated their applications (Behavioral Insights Team).

Conclusion

Many of the recommendations put forth here can be done with little cost, or at no cost at all. Any combination of approaches may yield improvements now, which can compound over time to create significant impact in the future.

Section 2: Thematic summary of research insights

Insights from recent research on recruiting for diversity in law enforcement are summarized below categorized by various themes, beginning with those that were common across studies and populations, and then providing more detail by race and gender and step in the process. Note that for insights common across multiple studies the generalized finding is not attributed, but when listed individually the sources are cited. Scholarly sources from 2019 to the present were reviewed using the search terms: “diversity,” “women,” “females,” “minority,” “Black,” “African American,” “Hispanic,” “race,” along with “recruiting” and “law enforcement” or “policing” as well as variants of these terms. The review of research was conducted in June 2021.

Insights common across studies:

- Females far less likely to be interested in a law enforcement career than males; perceive more barriers to success, opportunity, and acceptance on the job; and have lower respect for law enforcement
- People of color no less likely to be interested in a career in law enforcement, but perceive more barriers
- Attrition from the recruiting process and from the profession is higher for women and people of color
- Criminal justice majors, military veterans more likely to be interested in policing than peers
- Process delays a significant driver of attrition from the recruiting process
- Helping others was the most consistent top reason to enter the profession, but was seldom an effective recruiting message alone

Additional insights across race and/or gender:

- **Motivation/interest:**
 - Personal fulfillment and perceived success were the greatest predictors of interest in law enforcement career (Cambareri and Kuhns)
 - Male and female respondents equally likely to perceive family support for law enforcement career (Cambareri and Kuhns)
 - Salary, benefits and job security were the least common reasons for applying across all groups of interviewees. (Gibbs)
 - Most students were not influenced in their interest in a patrol career by the amount of respect the police receive (Scheer, Rossler and Papania)
- **Application process:**
 - 70% of respondents said a mentor would be a help to them in choosing a police career (Scheer, Rossler and Papania)
- **Attrition and job satisfaction:**
 - Job satisfaction was higher for those who were motivated to join based on working conditions and community, while for those motivated by benefits

there was no clear pattern for job satisfaction; no job satisfaction differences were found to be associated with sex, race, ethnicity, age or education. (Schuck)

- Benefits motivation for joining the job was associated with higher levels of attrition. (Schuck)
- The role of supervisors was a significant mitigating factor for job stress for male and female officers of all ethnicities. Supervisors who allowed them autonomy to do their job, respected their experience and valued their diversity had a positive impact on careers. (Suboch, Harrington and House)
- **New generation:**
 - 68% agreed with a statement about unrealistic expectations of entry level jobs, that “people of my generation want an immediately successful career without “paying their dues” at an entry level position.” Only 24% agreed that police departments understand their generation. (Scheer, Rossler and Papania)
- **Nudges:**
 - South Bend, IN tested sending postcards to potential recruits that referred to officer’s identity at home and at work, and found them seven times as effective as not sending a postcard at getting people to apply. (Behavioral Insights Team)
 - Tacoma, WA had a fourfold increase in applicants after adopting the “You belong here” message in its marketing, using personalized postcards. Postcards had simple, clear instructions and came from new officers or mid-management, not senior leaders so that potential recruits would have an easier time seeing their future selves in the role. (Behavioral Insights Team)
 - 15% more applicants submitted their background check forms to the LAPD, and 40% more sent them in within 2 weeks when the wording of the email was improved and with a short text message reminder. (Behavioral Insights Team)
 - When San Jose asked recruits who had dropped out of the process to provide feedback, and to consider reapplying, 125 reactivated their applications. (Behavioral Insights Team)

Additional insights relating to racial differences:

- **Motivations/interest in policing:**
 - Women and people of color ranked motivations related to being a role model to their community higher than men did (Clikninbeard, Solomon and Rief)
 - The most common reason to become an officer reported by both female and Black and Hispanic interviewees was fulfilling a childhood dream,

with 1 out of 5 women, 18% of Blacks and 13% of Hispanics reporting this motivation. (Gibbs)

- Predictors of a decrease in interest in a patrol career included social approval, respect for police and perception of racial profiling, all of which were higher for survey respondents who were students of color. Hence race plays an indirect effect on interest in a patrol career via these other variables. (Rossler, Scheer and Suttmoeller)
- Family disapproval of a police career choice was highest for African American students at 28%, followed by Latinx at 17% and whites at 10% (Scheer, Rossler and Papania)
- **Application process:**
 - When primed with an email reduce stereotype threat minority applicants for a UK police force had a 50% greater likelihood of passing the test, and the gap between white and minority pass rates disappeared. (Linos, Reinhard and Ruda)
 - From 2014 to 2018, CO State Patrol saw an average increase of 10 percentage points in applicants of racial/ethnic minority and a 17 percentage point increase in appointments of individuals from a racial/ethnic minority. Over the same time period, there was an increase of 3 percentage points in women applicants and appointments to the CSP. (Krueger, Robson & Keller)
- **Organizational culture:**
 - People of color had more concern about “fit” with the agency than did whites (Clikninbeard, Solomon and Rief)
 - The majority of all survey respondents believe that police engage in racial profiling, with 67% of African American, 52% of Latinx, 28% of white, 45% of other students agreeing (Scheer, Rossler and Papania)
 - African American and Hispanic officers experienced tokenism in the form of visibility and polarization. African American and Hispanic participants noted their peers viewed their actions through a racial lens and that they experienced subtle and unconscious racism in the form of lack of opportunities. Peer support and mentoring increase retention of women and people of color in law enforcement. (Suboch, Harrington and House)
- **Nudges:**
 - LAPD increased the number of minority applicants with Facebook ads targeting predominantly black communities. (Behavioral Insights Team)
 - In Washington, DC, postcards sent to 30,000 registered voters in primarily black neighborhoods and describing the challenge of the job decreased the likelihood of men in that neighborhood applying. For women who received a postcard with a female officer on it with the message that policing was their “next step” three times as many women applied. (Behavioral Insights Team)

- In Portland, OR postcards to a predominantly black neighborhood with “Your Neighborhood, Your Police” reduced interest in applications while messages about the salary and benefits of the job were more effective. Motivations for joining the police for those from underrepresented groups indicate they are more likely to say they joined to “create change within the policing profession.” This message was effectively used in LA. (Behavioral Insights Team)

Additional insights relating to gender differences:

- ***Interest/motivation:***
 - Females more likely to express interest after seeing fitness requirements (Aiello)
 - Women and people of color ranked motivations related to being a role model to their community higher than white men did (Clikninbeard, Solomon and Rief)
 - While females were three times less likely than males to aspire to be police, this difference was entirely mitigated by masculine self-concept (Clikninbeard, Solomon and Rief)
 - Females as likely as males to recommend the job to others but less likely to apply themselves. (Clikninbeard, Solomon and Rief)
 - The most common reason to become an officer reported by both female and Black and Hispanic interviewees was fulfilling a childhood dream, with 1 out of 5 women, 18% of Blacks and 13% of Hispanics reporting this motivation. (Gibbs)
- ***Application process:***
 - Both police chiefs and female officers attribute the low level of women in policing to low levels of female applicants, yet females attribute higher levels of attrition to male-dominated culture in the academy and workplace (Cordner and Cordner)
 - From 2014 to 2018, Colorado State Patrol saw an average increase of 10 percentage points in applicants of racial/ethnic minority and a 17 percentage point increase in appointments of individuals from a racial/ethnic minority. Over the same time period, there was an increase of 3 percentage points in women applicants and appointments to the CSP. (Krueger, Robson & Keller)
 - 19% of female students are intimidated by the police recruiting process (compared to 12% of males) (Scheer, Rossler and Papania)
- ***Academy:***
 - 43% of female respondents were intimidated by the fitness element of the training academy (Scheer, Rossler and Papania)
 - Women had higher attrition from the academy than men. When academy classes were less than 20% female, female attrition was higher when measured at the end of their time in the academy. When academy classes

were 25% female or more, there was no difference between male and female attrition from the academy. (Schuck)

- **Organizational culture:**

- Female officers experienced tokenism in the form of visibility and polarization. Females noted efforts they had to make to gain “some semblance of credibility” in their organization as compared to males and noted they were often viewed as unequal, despite having met the same entrance requirements as males. Peer support and mentoring increase retention of women and people of color in law enforcement. (Suboch, Harrington and House)
- Women did not report the discriminatory behavior they endured during training, often instead relying on peer support to get through it. Women reported sexist remarks, insulting behaviors, sexist attitudes, and explicit material or jokes, but they did not report this as discriminatory behavior and instead “modified their own behavior in order to gain acceptance, as well as not reporting those behaviors” (Suboch, Harrington and House, p. 113)
- Female officers who were open about their lesbianism had an easier time integrating with their male counterparts at work than other women. (Suboch, Harrington and House)

Insights related to organizational culture and diversity:

- Organizations have largely failed to reap the benefits of diversity because they do not leverage the insights of individuals from different backgrounds, and that “increasing the number of traditionally underrepresented people in your workforce does not *automatically* produce benefits” (Ely and Thomas, p. 117). Rather, organizations will only improve effectiveness when they foster inquiry, egalitarianism, and learning. Individuals from underrepresented groups need to have a voice, “Being genuinely valued and respected involves more than just feeling included. It involves having the power to help set the agenda, influence what – and how – work is done, have one’s needs and interests taken into account, and have one’s contributions recognized and rewarded with further opportunities to contribute and advance.” (Ely and Thomas, p. 118)
- Leaders in police organizations have the power to set the tone on a culture of egalitarianism and learning, openness to listening to others’ perspectives, engaging in uncomfortable conversations about differences, and accepting feedback without judgement or criticism.
- This is important because, “Leaders are the stewards of an organization’s culture; their behaviors and mindsets reverberate throughout the organization. Hence to dismantle systems of discrimination and subordination, leaders must undergo the same shifts of heart, mind and behavior that they want for the organization as a whole and then translate those personal shifts to real, lasting change in their companies.” (Ely and Thomas, p. 119)

Section 3: Alphabetical Listing of Studies Included

Recruiting for Diversity in Law Enforcement: Review of Selected Recent Research

The table that follows provides an alphabetical listing of reviewed research along with selected insights from each study relevant to attracting more females and people of color to the law enforcement profession. Studies are primarily from 2019 to the present. Scholarly sources were reviewed using the search terms: “diversity,” “women,” “females,” “minority,” “Black,” “African American,” “Hispanic,” “race,” along with “recruiting” and “law enforcement” or “policing” as well as variants of these terms. The review of research was conducted in June 2021.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
<p>Aiello (2019)</p> <p>Gendered messages in police recruitment: Understanding the impacts of descriptors and physical fitness requirements on potential applicants</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 170 undergraduate students in criminal justice courses • Experimental design with students receiving varied recruiting messages from a police department to test engagement and interest of different messages. <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When taking the first step toward applying for a police job (providing their email address) black and white students had no difference in their rate of interest. • Females expressed significantly less interest in policing careers than men. • Criminal justice majors are significantly more likely to provide email addresses than non criminal justice majors. • Female students were more likely to provide contact information (an indicator of interest in applying for a police job), when shown information about the physical fitness requirement that demonstrated that male and female fitness requirements were different, with the female requirement being less stringent. • Inclusive language did not spark different levels of interest among potential recruits. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assess physical fitness requirements, and if females are not at a disadvantage, proactively provide that information to them in recruiting messages. • Leverage criminal justice programs as sources of recruits.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
<p>Behavioral Insights Team (2019)</p> <p>Behavioral Insights for Building the Police Force of Tomorrow</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Various behavioral economics (or “nudge”) experiments conducted with selected cities participating in the Bloomberg Philanthropies What Works Cities program and electing to work with the Behavioral Insights Team, testing various recruiting strategies and experiments to vary language and processes used in recruitment methods using small randomized controlled trials (RCTs). <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In a survey of 1,200 current law enforcement officers on motivation to pursue the job, “help people in the community” was the most frequent top motivation, yet this message is not the most effective in motivating potential recruits to apply. • South Bend, IN tested sending postcards to potential recruits that referred to officer’s identity at home and at work, and found them seven times as effective as not sending a postcard at getting people to apply. • LAPD increased the number of minority applicants with Facebook ads targeting predominantly black communities. • Tacoma, WA had a fourfold increase in applicants after adopting the “You belong here” message in its marketing, using personalized postcards. • Postcards had simple, clear instructions and came from new officers or mid-management, not senior leaders so that potential recruits would have an easier time seeing their future selves in the role. • 15% more applicants submitted their background check forms to the LAPD, and 40% more sent them in within 2 weeks when the wording of the email was improved and with a short text message reminder. • Text message reminders to take the test sent in Tacoma and Fort Worth did not increase the number of potential recruits taking the exam. • Allowing applicants to self-schedule for their exam did not improve exam turnout rates, possibly because those who are not proactively setting dates for their tests are still preparing and are not ready (seen in Baltimore, Chattanooga and San Jose). • In Washington, DC, postcards sent to 30,000 registered voters in primarily black neighborhoods and describing the challenge of the job decreased the likelihood of men in that neighborhood of applying. For women who received a postcard with a female officer on it with the message that policing was their “next step” three times as many women applied. • In Portland, OR postcards to a predominantly black neighborhood with “Your Neighborhood, Your Police” reduced interest in applications while messages about the salary and benefits of the job were more effective. Motivations for joining the police for those from underrepresented groups indicate they are more likely to say they joined to “create change within the policing profession.” This message was effectively used in LA. • When San Jose asked recruits who had dropped out of the process to provide feedback, and to consider reapplying, 125 reactivated their applications. Little Rock received 40 new applications and Scottsdale 222 when outreach was made to inactive potential recruits who had previously applied.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Women were less likely than men to say they joined because they “have friends/relatives who were police officers.” • Women were less likely than men to say they joined law enforcement because it was a “lifelong dream or aspiration.” <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experiment with different recruiting messages, measure results and continue those that produce results and discontinue those that don't. • Experiment with “nudges” and reminders at different points in the process to see which ones improve turnout. • Simplify language on all communication with recruits so that next steps are always clear. • Process matters - eliminate procedural pain points to keep more candidates in the process. • Thinking of the recruiting process as a series of micro-decisions by the candidate to stay engaged, and look at every step of the process for ways to keep interested candidates engaged (Notes that half of police recruits drop out of the process because it is so long). <p>Reach out to those who have shown interest in the past but dropped out of the process, ask them for feedback on the process and invite them to reapply.</p>
<p>Cambareri and Kuhns (2018)</p> <p>Perceptions and Perceived Challenges Associated With a Hypothetical Career in Law Enforcement: Differences Among Male and Female College Students</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Survey of 387 undergraduate students in introductory criminal justice courses at a large university in the southeast <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Male students were twice as likely as female students to be “very interested” in a career in law enforcement. • Female students are less likely than male peers to believe they will be successful as officers, and perceive feeling less fulfilled by the thought of police work. • There was no difference between male and female officers in their belief that family and friends would support the decision to enter law enforcement. • Female students believe that female officers receive less respect, acceptance and opportunity • Personal fulfillment and perceived success were the variables that best predicted interest in a law enforcement career. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To attract more female candidates, in marketing messages, emphasize community-centered and service-oriented aspects of the work to highlight the fulfilling components of the profession. • Assess policies or practices that could create barriers to making female officers successful, address any negative impacts. Then, when recruiting, assure potential recruits that they will be able to be successful on the job.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
<p>Clinkinbeard, Solomon and Rief (2021)</p> <p>Why Did You Become A Police Officer? Entry-Related Motives and Concerns of Women and Men in Policing</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 832 officers in two Midwestern police departments (most of sample mid-career w avg of 10 years of service) • Surveys sought to measure officer recollection of prior motivation and concerns about the profession <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Helping or serving people” is consistently ranked as the highest motivation for becoming a police officer. • Both women and people of color ranked “legacy” motivations (being a role model, showing that people like me can be a good officer) higher than men did. • Women rated helping people in the community, having a challenging career, the opportunity to solve problems, helping others live a better life, serving as a role model, showing women make good officers, and using the job as a stepping stone higher than men. • Men rated the ability to work on their own and companionship higher than women did. • Women rated the concern about being taken seriously, discrimination, and the physical nature of the job as a higher concern than men. • People of color had greater concern about “fit” with the job than white officers. • The authors note that “Change that leads to real systemic change in climate and equity will be more effective than any single recruitment strategy or marketing plan.” (730) <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recruiters should tap into recruits’ desire to change the image of policing for future generations (“legacy” motivations). • “Helping or serving people” should be emphasized in recruiting messages, given that it is consistently ranked as the highest motivation for becoming a police officer.
<p>Clinkinbeard, Solomon and Rief (2020)</p> <p>Who Dreams of Badges? Gendered Self-Concept and Policing Career Aspirations</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Survey of 717 students at two Midwestern universities, 40% criminal justice majors <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Female students three times less likely than male students to aspire to be police • Differences in career aspirations by gender were explained by masculine self-concept • Females are as likely as males to recommend the job to others but less likely to apply themselves • Blacks were significantly less likely than Whites to encourage others to become police <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To recruit more women, focus messages on the “helping people” aspects of the job

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assess recruiting materials for their portrayal of masculinity – do they focus mostly on the thrill-inducing and more masculine aspects of the job, or are the community building aspects also shown? Given that the majority of time spent on the job by officers is in the routine tasks not the adrenaline producing ones, recruiting materials with less emphasis on the hypermasculine aspects of the job would not only attract more female candidates, but would also be a more realistic sense of the work. Assess culture to determine degree of masculinity, and if hypermasculine culture exists, seek ways to bring more mitigating characteristics to the organization, such as relational and communication skills (traits more often linked to femininity than masculinity)
<p>Cordner & Cordner (2011)</p> <p>Stuck on a Plateau?: Obstacles to Recruitment, Selection, and Retention of Women Police</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Survey of police chiefs and female officers in three counties in PA with lower rates of female officers than the national average <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Both police chiefs (male) and officers (female) felt that the low representation of women in the field was due to low numbers of applicants. Perceptions of proactive recruitment differed, with 48% of male chiefs and 69% of female officers believing that their organization does not recruit women proactively. Female officers attributed higher rates of attrition among female officers to the male culture in the academy and the workplace.
<p>Ely and Thomas (2020)</p> <p>Getting Serious About Diversity: Enough Already with the Business Case</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Harvard Business Review article <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Authors bemoan that organizations have largely failed to reap the benefits of diversity because they do not leverage the insights of individuals from different backgrounds, and that “increasing the number of traditionally underrepresented people in your workforce does not <i>automatically</i> produce benefits” (117) Organizations will only improve effectiveness when they foster inquiry, egalitarianism, and learning. Their 1996 article advocated recruiting and retaining more people from underrepresented groups and “tapping into their identify related knowledge and experiences as resources for learning how the organization could perform its core work better.” (116) Their work demonstrated that “when companies take this approach, their teams are more effective than either homogeneous teams or diverse teams that don’t learn from their members’ differences.” (116)

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Individuals from underrepresented groups need to have a voice, “Being genuinely valued and respected involves more than just feeling included. It involves having the power to help set the agenda, influence what – and how – work is done, have one’s needs and interests taken into account, and have one’s contributions recognized and rewarded with further opportunities to contribute and advance.” (118) <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leaders in police organizations have the power to set the tone on a culture of egalitarianism and learning, openness to listening to others’ perspectives, engaging in uncomfortable conversations about differences, and accepting feedback without judgement or criticism. This is important because, “Leaders are the stewards of an organization’s culture; their behaviors and mindsets reverberate throughout the organization. Hence to dismantle systems of discrimination and subordination, leaders must undergo the same shifts of heart, mind and behavior that they want for the organization as a whole and then translate those personal shifts to real, lasting change in their companies.” (119)
<p>Gibbs (2020)</p> <p>Preventing Attrition among Women and Minority Police Applicants</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Telephone interviews with 143 women and minority candidates who withdrew from the hiring process <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Top reasons for withdrawing were (1) changing their mind about wanting the job/other personal reasons (2) finding another job and (3) the length of the hiring process. Together these three factors accounted for more than half of all responses. For female respondents, the most common reason was changing their mind/other personal reasons (27%). For Black respondents the most common reason was finding other employment (22%) and for Hispanic respondents the most common reason was equally split between process length and changing their mind/other personal reasons (22%) <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Shorten the selection process (author notes this challenge was pointed out by scholars at least as far back as 1975) Implement paperless process for hiring to improve efficiency and transparency Communicate more frequently with candidates in the process so they know they are still being considered Implement “buddy” or coach programs to help candidates through the process as the military does with their “battle buddy” program and as other agencies have done - Minneapolis hosts a Women’s Leadership Academy, a week-long program about policing taught primarily by women that includes follow up support through the application process, and the Guardians Association for Black NYPD officers, which helps applicants through the process.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
<p>Gibbs (2019)</p> <p>Diversifying the police applicant pool: motivations of women and minority candidates seeking police employment</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Phone interviews with 195 women and minority police cadet applicants to a large policing agency in the northeast • Large sample that is solely women and people of color <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The most common reason reported by both female and Black and Hispanic interviewees was fulfilling a childhood dream, with 1 out of 5 women, 18% of Blacks and 13% of Hispanics reporting this motivation. The other highly rated motivations were making a difference in the community/opportunity to help people, and policing as a good transition from military service. • Salary, benefits and job security were the least common reasons for applying across all groups of interviewees. <p><i>Suggested actions recommended by author (here and elsewhere):</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focus recruiting messages on the fact that policing is a great opportunity to help people, this may be a particularly helpful way to attract minorities to the job • Recruit from criminal justice programs and military/veteran agencies • Consider offering incentives to minority officers to recruit their friends and family, as the rate of family/friend legacy motivation was lowest among Black and Latinx respondents • Find ways to engage with young people in elementary school to spark the “childhood dream” motivation of becoming an officer • Develop Explorer, Cadet, and internship programs and other ways to keep youth engaged as civilians until they are old enough to apply for a job as a sworn officer • Use advertising messages that reinforce the “childhood dream” motivation for becoming an officer • Streamline hiring processes, as several applicants accepted other opportunities while in the hiring process. • Pair a promising recruit with a current officer (not necessarily a recruiter, but a current officer in the field) who can check in with the recruit periodically and give him/her advice throughout the hiring process. This will help reduce attrition (particularly for women and people of color) from the recruiting pipeline • Increase frequency of and automate communication to applicants to let them know they're still in the process and the agency is still interested in them. Lack of communication was a motivator for attrition from the process. There typically are long periods of no communication between each hurdle, and people might assume the agency is no longer interested and accept another job offer.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
<p>Koslicki, 2020</p> <p>Recruiting warriors or guardians? A content analysis of police recruitment videos</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 206 police recruiting videos from the largest municipal departments in the US • Content analysis to look for patterns in militarization and community-oriented policing in recruiting videos, which are advertisements for the departments' self-depictions. Content analysis was based on elements documented in the literature on militarism and community orientation <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 85% of videos show a female officer and 92% show an officer of color • For videos showing women, the amount of time they were speaking is half of that of the men • Most recruiting videos show community oriented policing themes (3/4) and most are not militaristic (57%). • About half of videos show a drawn firearm, split roughly evenly between training situations and non-training situations such as the firearm drawn toward a suspect <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Given that after personal communication with a recruiter, recruitment videos are the most effective recruitment medium, departments should carefully examine the message sent via their recruiting videos.
<p>Krueger, Robson & Keller (2019)</p> <p>An examination of recruiting and selection practices to promote diversity for Colorado state troopers.</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The CO State Patrol (CSP) partnered with RAND and received a COPS Field-Initiated Law Enforcement Microgrant • Through 20 interviews with recruiters, senior leaders, academy leadership, instructors, public affairs and human resources staff, the RAND team created a timeline of the CSP recruitment process and developed recommendations to improve it. <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • From 2014 to 2018, CSP saw an average increase of 10 percentage points in applicants of racial/ethnic minority and a 17 percentage point increase in appointments of individuals from a racial/ethnic minority. Over the same time period, there was an increase of 3 percentage points in women applicants and appointments to the CSP. • Lengthy hiring process is a key barrier to successful recruitment. • CSP moved applications online in 2016, replacing a paper-based application form with an electronic one, which significantly increased the number of applicants. • CSP uses Constant Contact to capture email addresses of all contacts who attend an event or express interest, allowing them to send standard correspondence to all candidates expressing any interest, saving time and improving consistency and accuracy of outgoing messaging, and capturing a much wider net of possible interested candidates. • Live chat is available from one of the three full-time recruiting staff members during work hours, allowing applicants more timely responses to their questions.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicants are given the chance to sign up for a ride-along with a trooper. Research has shown a consistent relationship between a realistic job preview (RJP) and both an applicant’s knowing what they are getting into and reduced attrition. • Applicants can take a test at one of three centers across the state and results are provided within a week. • Fitness requirements were removed as a screening method. • A video campaign specifically promoting the brand to women was created. • Women’s Resource Network provides CSP troopers support throughout their career. • A background investigation toolkit was created for recruits to prepare for the background investigation, which reduced the time it takes to conduct a background investigation. Self-assessment tool allows recruits to see what will be collected, how it will be assessed, and to address issues that arise. For example, a recruit with a low credit score can begin working on that before his or her official background check process begins, speeding and improving the result. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use an online application to increase the number of applicants. • Use a recruit tracking system to monitor progress at all stages of the process, including demographic information and information on reasons for choosing to apply. This will allow analysis of the characteristics most likely to lead from expression of interest to application, and to success in the recruitment and selection process, in the academy, and ultimately on the job. • Create a support network for women in the organization, and consider extending support to female recruits as they go through the selection process. • Appoint a senior leader with responsibility for diversity, given that research shows “One of the strongest factors influencing increases in organizational diversity is establishing positions with responsibility for diversity efforts.” • Use exit and “stay” interviews to understand why troopers leave, and also why they stay on the job, so the most challenging aspects of the job can be addressed and the most rewarding ones emphasized in recruitment messaging. In addition, RAND recommends reaching out to those who sign up to take the entrance exam but do not show up to take it, to understand attrition that happens even before the process has begun in earnest and how quality candidates might be retained. A national survey conducted by the Department of Justice found that 89% of state police agencies conducted exit interviews of sworn officers leaving service (Reaves, 2012). • Create a self-assessment toolkit for recruits to help them more quickly prepare for, and more likely succeed in the background investigation.
<p>Linou (2018)</p> <p>More Than Public Service: A Field Experiment on Job</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Potential applicants to the Chattanooga (TN) Police Department (20,000 postcards sent to registered voters over age 18) • Experiment with 4 treatment conditions and a control group to test various recruiting messages against the status quo message. Goal was to increase number of women and minorities applying at the Chattanooga PD

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
Advertisements and Diversity in the Police	<p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Small wording changes can make a big difference in interest in applying • Recruiting messages that focus on the personal benefits of the job (“Are you up for the challenge?” and “Looking for a long-term career?”) are three times as effective as the control in attracting applicants, and four times more effective in attracting applicants of color. • Messages focused on public service motivation alone do not attract more people, and must be combined with other messages to be effective. This may be due to the fact that novel stimuli attract attention, and the fact that police serve the public is not novel. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Test multiple recruiting messages and analyze impact so that the most persuasive messages can be emphasized.
Linos, Reinhard and Ruda (2017) Levelling the playing field in police recruitment: Evidence from a field experiment on test performance	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • UK police force with an open recruiting round • Randomized control trial of an email that primed test-takers with language that reduced stereotype threat and reinforced belonging and values affirmation, comparison of results across white and non-white test takers for this online Situational Judgement Test <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Small changes in language can improve test scores for all, and can close racial gaps in scores between whites and minority recruits. • When primed with an email to reduce stereotype threat (behavior that conforms to stereotype, e.g. women failing fitness tests), minority applicants for a UK police force had a 50% greater likelihood of passing the test, and the gap between white and minority pass rates disappeared. • As this experiment looked at the combined effect of three leading factors thought to impact success of minority candidates on public service exams (reducing stereotype threat and increasing belonging and values affirmation), it cannot be determined which of the three was the most important factor. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In recruiting materials and in testing invitations, seek ways to reduce stereotype threat and to affirm belonging and values.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
<p>McMullen and Gibbs (2019)</p> <p>Tattoos in policing: a survey of state police policies</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 50 state-level police agencies, policy review to explore similarities and state-level correlates <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The majority of state police agencies have an appearance policy regarding tattoos. State policing agencies that have a “no visibility” policy regarding tattoos were often in states with a low percentage of millennial residents, and a high percentage of young veterans, men, non-Hispanic white citizens, and low crime.
<p>Morrow, Vickovic, Dario and Shjarback (2019)</p> <p>Examining a Ferguson Effect on College Students’ Motivation to Become Police Officers</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Survey of 652 undergraduate and graduate students in criminal justice courses at two US universities about perceptions of the police and career aspirations <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Notes prior research consistently over time has shown the opportunity to help people has been the most important motivator to become a police officer. Other key motivators are job security and crime fighting, along with the excitement of the job and the job benefits. Students who believe there is a “Ferguson Effect” in policing (negative attention and greater dangerousness of the job) were more likely to report apprehension about applying for law enforcement jobs. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Departments can mitigate the negative impact on recruit interest by engaging in procedural justice, and by making a concerted effort to engage proactively and positively with their community. Suggestions include regularly participating in job fairs and opportunities to guest speak in class, and creating internship programs and research collaborations with local universities.
<p>Rossler, Rabe-Hemp, Peuterbaugh and Scheer (2020)</p> <p>Influence of Gender on Perceptions of Barriers to a Police Patrol Career</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Survey of 640 undergraduate criminal justice students across five public universities to understand barriers to entering a law enforcement career among potential applicants <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Female students, even in criminal justice programs, still lag males in their interest in patrol careers. Authors suggest that females have developed a “reaction formation” to the profession by excluding themselves from a profession in which they believe they cannot succeed. Female students report less respect for the law enforcement profession, less confidence in their physical abilities to do the job and the academy process.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Female students expressed more concern about being Tasered during training, more concern about work-life balance and the stress of the job. • Female students expressed greater apprehension about competing for a patrol position than their male colleagues. • Criminal justice majors express more interest in entering police patrol compared to other majors. Those with prior military experience express more interest in a law enforcement career than others. • African-American students showed less respect for the police, were more apprehensive about being Tasered at the academy and felt they would receive more disapproval for entering the profession than white students did. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Academy practices that are disconcerting to women or people of color should be examined (e.g. being Tasered), and if changed then those changes should be communicated in recruiting efforts. • Pursuing family-friendly policies, such as access to sponsored childcare, flexible work schedules, maternity leave policies, etc. may lower barriers to women believing they can succeed in the career and may increase the number of female applicants. • Making upward mobility possible for female officers via mentoring and eliminating barriers can demonstrate that female applicants' perceived barriers can be broken in the "brass ceiling."
<p>Rossler, Scheer and Suttmoeller (2019)</p> <p>Patrol career interest and perceptions of barriers among African-American criminal justice students</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Survey of 630 undergraduate criminal justice students across five public universities <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interest in a patrol career did not differ by race, but being male, being a criminal justice major, and having military experience did increase interest in patrol careers • Predictors of a decrease in interest in a patrol career included social approval, respect for police and perception of racial profiling. Hence race plays an indirect effect on interest in a patrol career via these other variables. • African-American survey respondents reported lower social approval from parents, friends and significant others for entry into a patrol police officer career • African-American survey respondents reported lower levels of respect for police than white respondents • African-American respondents did not view information or the background check process as a barrier to entry to the field • Latinx and respondents of other races perceived access to information about and mentoring for a police career as a barrier • African-American, Latinx and respondents of other races were significantly more likely to agree that police engage in racial profiling than white respondents

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The authors suggest that police agencies can attract African-American recruits by “improving perceptions of the police in Black and African-American communities.” The authors suggest outreach to community and faith-based organizations as well as direct one-on-one engagement with the candidate as well as their influencers (i.e., home visits, or speaking directly to a candidate’s family).
<p>Scheer, Rossler and Papania, 2018</p> <p>Interest in Police Patrol Careers: An Assessment of Potential Candidates’ Impressions of the Police Recruitment, Selection, and Training Processes</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Survey of 772 college students enrolled in criminal justice courses <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 39% of students express interest in a police patrol career, yet 54% say they are only interested in a police patrol career as a stepping stone to another job (79% say it is a good stepping stone to a federal law enforcement career) 19% of female students are intimidated by the police recruiting process (compared to 12% of males) 70% of respondents said a mentor would be a help to them in choosing a police career 68% agreed with a statement about unrealistic expectations of entry level jobs, that “people of my generation want an immediately successful career without “paying their dues” at an entry level position.” Only 24% agreed that police departments understand their generation. 43% of female respondents were intimidated by the fitness element of the training academy Most students were not influenced in their interest in a patrol career by the amount of respect the police receive Family disapproval of a police career choice was highest for African American students at 28%, followed by Latinx at 17% and whites at 10% The majority of all survey respondents believe that police engage in racial profiling, with 67% of African American, 52% of Latinx, 28% of white, 45% of other students agreeing Respondents are under-informed about law enforcement career paths, and few understand what a police supervisor does. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mentoring is part of police culture (field training) and could be extended to the recruitment process. Candidates of color, whose families are more likely to disapprove of the career choice than white recruits, might be especially helped by mentoring. Authors recommend recasting the recruiter in a “football coach” model, meeting with the family, exercising with the candidate, building rapport and opening lines of communication. Realistic job preview (shown to reduce attrition in other research) in the form of ride-alongs, mentoring, and internships take on more importance given how little the survey respondents knew about the roles of police, the career path and promotions, and their unrealistic expectations about not wanting to work their way up from an entry level position.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Respondents would benefit from one-on-one communication of the process.
<p>Schuck, 2020</p> <p>Motivations for a career in policing: social group differences and occupational satisfaction</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1,000 police recruits in departments participating in the National Police Research Platform • Survey aimed to understand motivations to become an officer and to examine differences by gender and racial ethnic group <p><i>Key findings:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recruiting messages that focus on both the humanitarian motivations such as working with people and the economic motivations such as stability of the job, are more successful in attracting women and people of color than are messages based on working conditions (excitement and prestige of the job). • Job satisfaction was higher for those who were motivated to join based on working conditions and community, while for those motivated by benefits there was no clear pattern for job satisfaction. • No job satisfaction differences were found to be associated with sex, race, ethnicity, age or education. • Benefits motivation for joining the job was associated with higher levels of attrition. • Women had higher attrition from the academy than men. • When academy classes were less than 20% female, female attrition was higher when measured at the end of their time in the academy. When academy classes were 25% female or more, there was no difference between male and female attrition from the academy. <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study reasons for female attrition from the academy to retain more recruited officers. • Target recruiting messages to specific audiences (females, people of color) based on the messages that resonate best for them.
<p>Suboch, Harrington and House (2017)</p> <p>Why do Female and Minority Police Officers Remain in Law Enforcement?</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-depth interviews with 33 law enforcement professionals in Las Vegas <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Female, African American and Hispanic officers experienced tokenism in the form of visibility and polarization. • Females noted efforts they had to make to gain “some semblance of credibility” in their organization as compared to males and noted they were often viewed as unequal, despite having met the same entrance requirements as males. • African American and Hispanic participants noted their peers viewed their actions through a racial lens and that they experienced subtle and unconscious racism in the form of lack of opportunities.

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peer support and mentoring increase retention of women and people of color in law enforcement. • Women did not report the discriminatory behavior they endured during training, often instead relying on peer support to get through it. Women reported sexist remarks, insulting behaviors, sexist attitudes, and explicit material or jokes, but they did not report this as discriminatory behavior and instead “modified their own behavior in order to gain acceptance, as well as not reporting those behaviors” (113) • Female officers who were open about their lesbianism had an easier time integrating with their male counterparts at work than other women. • The role of supervisors was a significant mitigating factor for job stress for male and female officers of all ethnicities. Supervisors who allowed them autonomy to do their job, respected their experience and valued their diversity had a positive impact on careers. • Stress and family support were not significant factors in careers for female officers. • Perceived gender inequity and lack of family friendly policies increase female attrition (Harr) <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create peer support and mentoring programs for women and people of color to help them remain in the profession. • Assess the degree to which discriminatory behavior is tolerated by women and people of color in order to remain in their jobs. If discrimination is found, address it with polices and with enforcement of those polices.
<p>Todak (2017)</p> <p>The Decision to Become a Police Officer in a Legitimacy Crisis</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-depth interviews with 42 criminal justice college students who wanted to become police officers to understand why they wanted to become an officer, what they expected of the job, and how they were preparing for the job <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While participants were aware of negative public sentiment toward policing, they remained interested in the profession • One third of respondents decided to become a police officer during childhood, another third during high school, and another third during their criminal justice courses in college. • Helping people was the single most common factor respondents looked forward to about policing (74% of interviewees) • Another common factor was avoiding a desk job and the unpredictability of police work (43% of interviewees) • A number of interviewees, well aware of negative opinions of police among the public wanted to be good examples by their work and show that those perceptions are wrong • Nearly as many viewed the job as a stepping stone to federal law enforcement as saw themselves having a career in patrol • 40% of the women in the study expressed a desire to enter the profession to prove that they were capable of it, whereas none of the male interviewees expressed this motivation

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participants were concerned about the potential for desensitization to trauma, heightened vigilance, and about the possibility of making a mistake on the job given the heightened scrutiny and social media of the current environment. • 64% of females, and many of the males, felt there would be unique dangers of the job faced by women (e.g. going alone to a domestic violence call); some women also felt they would have a hard time being taken seriously in the role. • Both female and male respondents felt that more women in policing would bring new skills that could help rebuild community trust of police <p><i>Suggested actions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In addition to college and high schools, develop police visibility in elementary schools to tap into the 1/3 of the study population that has wanted to become officers since childhood • Recruitment messages that highlight the ability to make a difference, be a role model and change public perception of the police may appeal to students such as the ones in this study • The author suggests departments develop ride-along programs to give potential applicants a view into the work and to attract more potential candidates. • To recruit more women, provide visibility to female officers and the realities of the job during the recruiting process to reduce stereotypical thinking about the role of women in policing.
<p>Todak, Huff and James (2018)</p> <p>Investigating perceptions of race and ethnic diversity among prospective police officers</p>	<p><i>Sample/method:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-depth interviews with 42 criminal justice college students in the southwest; participants were mostly Hispanic, Native American, Black and Middle Eastern <p><i>Key relevant insights:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participants expressed positive views of the benefits of diversity in law enforcement, noting that it could improve approachability of police for people of color • Participants who were of racial/ethnic minority believed their race/ethnicity could be an advantage when responding to a call from a member of their own group, due to increased cultural sensitivity and/or language ability • Participants believed their race/ethnicity would have adverse effects on their police work, especially when interacting with members of other ethnic groups • Both white and minority participants expressed concerns about being exposed to racism on the job • Participants feared that members of their same racial/ethnic group may want special treatment based on their group status • Notes that diversity in law enforcement typically lags increases in diversity in the general population (e.g. Phoenix is 41% Latinx while the Phoenix PD is 13% Latinx)

Author/Title	Selected Relevant Insights
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Notes that Carter and Sapp (1991) and Pane (2016) identify the disproportionate barriers faced by minority candidates in the screening process due to educational requirements and past contact with law enforcement.

Acknowledgements

The author thanks the Massachusetts State Police, Massachusetts Executive Office of Public Safety and Security for funding this work. The author thanks Michael Ward and the Collins Center at the University of Massachusetts Boston for guidance and support. Research support was provided by Madeleine Smith, Research Assistant, Harvard Kennedy School. The author thanks Amanda Hallock for editorial review and comment.

Sources

Aiello, M. "Influential Women? Policing Styles in Online Recruitment Materials," *Police Quarterly*, 2020, Vol. 23(1) 3-24.

The Behavioral Insights Team, *Behavioral Insights for Building the Police Force of Tomorrow*

Cambareri, J. F., & Kuhns, J. B. (2018). "Perceptions and perceived challenges associated with a hypothetical career in law enforcement: Differences among male and female college students." *Police Quarterly*, 21(3), 335-357.

Center for State & Local Government Excellence. "State and Local Government Workforce: 2020 Survey." April, 2020.

Clinkinbeard, Samantha S. and Rachael M. Rief. "Four Steps to Bring More Women into Policing," *Police Chief Magazine*. June 23, 2020.

Clinkinbeard, S., Solomon, S. and Rief, R. "Who Dreams of Badges? Gendered Self-Concept and Policing Career Aspirations." *Feminist Criminology*, 2020, Vol. 15(5) 567-592

Clinkinbeard, S., Solomon, S. and Rief, R. "Why Did You Become a Police Officer? Entry-Related Motives and Concerns of Women and Men in Policing." *Criminal Justice and Behavior*, 2021, Vol. 48, No. 6, June 2021, 715-733.

Cordner, G., & Cordner, A. "Stuck on a plateau? Obstacles to recruitment, selection, and retention of women police." *Police Quarterly*, 14(3), 207-226.

Ely, Robin J. and David A. Thomas. "Getting Serious About Diversity. Enough Already with the Business Case." *Harvard Business Review*. November-December 2020 Issue.

Donohue Jr., R.H. "Shades of Blue: A review of the hiring, recruitment, and selection of female and minority police officers." *The Social Science Journal* (2019).

Gibbs, J. "Diversifying the police applicant pool: motivations of women and minority candidates seeking police employment," *Criminal Justice Studies*, 32:3, 207-221. (2019)

Gibbs, J. "Preventing Attrition among Women and Minority Police Applicants," *Policing*, Volume 00, Number 0, pp. 1-17 (2020)

Gustafson, Joseph L. "Tokenism in policing: An empirical test of Kanter's hypothesis." *Journal of Criminal Justice* 36. 2008.

Hubbard, Timothy M. "Millennials: Adapting Police Recruiting and Supervision Practices." The Bill Blackwood Law Enforcement Management Institute of Texas. February, 2019.

International Association of Chiefs of Police. "The State of Recruitment: A Crisis For Law Enforcement." September, 2019.

Koslicki, W. "Recruiting warriors or guardians? A content analysis of police recruitment videos," *Policing and Society*, 2020.

Krentz, Matt, Justin Dean, Jenn Garcia-Alonso, Frances Brooks Taplett, Miki Tsusaka and Elliot Vaugh. "Fixing the Flawed Approach to Diversity," Boston Consulting Group. January, 2019.

Krueger, T.C., Robson, S., & Keller, K.M. *An examination of recruiting and selection practices to promote diversity for Colorado state troopers*. RAND Corporation: Santa Monica, CA. 2019.

Linos, E., Reinhard, J. and Ruda, S. "Levelling the playing field in police recruitment: Evidence from a field experiment on test Performance." *Public Administration*. 2017;95:943-956.

Linos, E. "More Than Public Service: A Field Experiment on Job Advertisements and Diversity in the Police." *Journal of Public Administration Research And Theory*, 2018, 67-85

McMullen, S. and Gibbs, J. "Tattoos in policing: a survey of state police policies." *Policing: An International Journal*, Vol. 42 No. 3, 2019

Morison, Kevin P. "Hiring for the 21st Century Law Enforcement Officer: Challenges, Opportunities, and Strategies for Success." Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services. 2017.

Morrow, W. J., Vickovic, S. G., Dario, L. M., & Shjarback, J. A. "Examining Ferguson effect on college students' motivation to become police officers." *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 30(4), 585-605. 2019.

Muhlhausen, David B. "Women in Policing: Breaking Barriers and Blazing a Path." National Institute of Justice. July, 2019.

National Police Foundation. "5 Things You Need To Know From Agencies Participating In The National Law Enforcement Applied Research & Data Platform." January, 2019.

Nowacki, Jeffrey, Joseph A. Schafer and Julie Hibdon. "Workforce Diversity in Police Hiring: The Influence of Organizational Characteristics." *Justice Evaluation Journal*. April 30, 2020.

Police Executive Research Forum, *The Workforce Crisis, and What Police Agencies Are Doing About It*, September, 2019.

President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing. *Final Report of the President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing*. Washington, DC. 2015.

Rossler, M., Rabe-Hemp, C., Peuterbaugh, M. and Scheer, C. "Influence of Gender on Perceptions of Barriers to a Police Patrol Career," *Police Quarterly*, 0(0) 1-28. 2020.

Rossler, M., Scheer, C., and Suttmoeller, M. "Patrol career interest and perceptions of barriers among African-American criminal justice students," *Policing: An International Journal*, Vol. 42 Issue: 3, pp.421-440. 2019.

Scheer, C., Rossler, M., Papania, L. *Interest in Police Patrol Careers: An Assessment of Potential Candidates' Impressions of the Police Recruitment, Selection, and Training Processes*. 2018.

Schuck, A. "Female Representation in Law Enforcement: The Influence of Screening, Unions, Incentives, Community Policing, CALEA, and Size." *Police Quarterly*. Vol. 17 (I). 2014.

Schuck, A. "Motivations for a career in policing: social group differences and occupational satisfaction," *Police Practice and Research*. 2020.

Suboch, G., Harrington, C. and House, J. "Why do Female and Minority Police Officers Remain in Law Enforcement?" *Race, Gender & Class*, 2017, Vol. 24, No. 3-4, pp. 100-118.

Todak, N., Huff, J. & James, L. "Investigating perceptions of race and ethnic diversity among prospective police officers," *Police Practice and Research*. 2018.

Todak, N. "The Decision to Become a Police Officer in a Legitimacy Crisis," *Women & Criminal Justice*, 27:4, 250-270. 2017.

United States Government Accountability Office, "U.S. Customs and Border Protection: Progress and Challenges in Recruiting, Hiring, and Retaining Law Enforcement Personnel." June, 2018.

Vera Institute of Justice & International City/County Management Association. "The Model Police Officer: Recruitment, Training, and Community Engagement." September, 2018.

Williams, Jamillah Bowman and Jonathan Cox. "The New Principle-Practice Gap: The Disconnect between Diversity Beliefs and Actions in the Workplace." Georgetown University Law Center. August, 2020.

Wilson, Charles P., Shirley A. Wilson and Mary Gwann. "Identifying barriers to diversity in law enforcement agencies." *Journal of Ethnicity in Criminal Justice*. Vol 14 (4). August, 2016.

Wilson, J.M., Dalton, E., Scheer, C., & Grammich, C.A. *Police recruitment and retention for the new millennium: The state of knowledge*. RAND Corporation: Santa Monica, CA. 2010.

Interviews with author:

Dr. RaShall M. Brackney, Chief of Police, Charlottesville, VA, June 17, 2021

Captain Phillip Buck, Executive Officer, Office of Employee Relations & Community Outreach, New Jersey State Police, Major Carla Thomas, Commanding Officer, Office of Employee Relations & Community Outreach, New Jersey State Police, and Captain Lisa Acker, Community Outreach Bureau Chief, New Jersey State Police, May 26, 2021

Dic Donohue, PhD, Associate Policy Researcher, Behavioral and Policy Sciences, RAND Corporation, May 13, 2021

Lieutenant Justin Gross, Commander, Recruitment & Selection Unit, Maryland State Police, May 21, 2021

Marvin Haiman, Chief of Staff, formerly Executive Director, Professional Development Bureau, Metropolitan Police Department, May 20, 2021

Bob Harrison, Adjunct International/Defense Researcher, RAND Corporation, May 6, 2021

Technical Lieutenant Rodger Kirsopp, Member Hiring Unit, New York State Police, May 21, 2021

Dr. W. M. Koslicki, Department of Criminal Justice and Criminology, Ball State University, June 17, 2021

Sgt. Derrick Leto, Diversity Officer, Worcester Police Department, May 14, 2021

Charlie Scheer, Ph. D., *Associate Professor, Director, Graduate Program*, The University of Southern Mississippi, May 10, 2021

First Lieutenant Duane Zook, Commander - Recruiting and Selection Section, Human Resources Division, Michigan State Police, May 17, 2021